



DIFFERENT BUT EQUAL

Equal value: a guide to comparing jobs

WORKBOOK FOR COMPARING JOBS

www.closesthegap.org.uk



HOW TO USE THE WORKBOOK

This workbook accompanies the publication *Different But Equal: Factors to Consider*.

Factors to Consider is a guide to the process of identifying where men and women are doing jobs which are the same or of equal value, that is those involving similar levels of skills and knowledge. It helps even the smallest business to assess whether or not their staff are receiving equal pay.

In order to ensure that your job evaluation is as robust as possible, please refer to *Factors to Consider* before and during your completion of this workbook.

Copies of *Factors to Consider* available free of charge from:

Close the Gap
333 Woodlands Road
Glasgow
G3 6NG
0141 337 8100
www.closesthegap.org.uk

JOB A

SAMPLE

For Job A write down all the demands of this job, using the guidance provided in *Factors to Consider* to help you categorise each demand.

JOB B

For Job B write down all the demands of this job, using the guidance provided in *Factors to Consider* to help you categorise each demand.

COMPARE THE DEMANDS

Taking all of the elements of each post into account, you are now required to make a judgment on whether the posts are equally demanding, or if one is more demanding than the other.

Highlighting the specific points that contributed to this decision, you should then record your decision in this space. Make sure that you have provided full details of the reason for your decision.

Page 4 describes how to use the score box.



METHOD FOR EVALUATING

The legislation does not make direct reference to the term 'factors'. The Equal Pay Act refers to headings such as **skill, effort and decision-making**, and although these three factors are not compulsory, the legislation gives a clear indication that these factors should be used to determine equal pay between different jobs. Factors are normally discrete demands found in a job or a range of jobs. Most factors within job evaluation schemes fall within the generic headings of **knowledge, skills, responsibility, effort and working conditions** but they do not necessarily have the same names, nor fall neatly within five factors. For the purposes of this exercise, however, these generic headings will be used.

In a factor comparison exercise, evaluations can be made for each factor between each of the jobs. You will need to decide whether one job is more demanding, equally demanding or less demanding in each factor than the other. For ease, we have attributed a simple points system to each of these answers as follows.

For example, under the factor **Knowledge**, job A is more demanding than job B.

IS JOB A -	PLEASE TICK ONE ONLY	SCORE
MORE DEMANDING THAN JOB B OR	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	+1
EQUALLY DEMANDING AS B OR	<input type="checkbox"/>	0
LESS DEMANDING THAN B?	<input type="checkbox"/>	-1

In making this decision, you are not looking for two jobs to be the mirror image of each other before they can be considered equally demanding. However, different descriptors should assist to guide you as to what might be considered different generally.

If, however, in comparing the two aspects of the jobs you find that there is a substantial difference between them you may wish to indicate this with a higher number to reflect the scale of difference. If you do this you should note down why this is so.

When the comparisons have been made for each of the factors, you can then examine the profile of different jobs as set out in this workbook.

Before a decision can be made under each factor, you must first take each job in turn and think about the job requirements under the different headings. Before you make any comparisons, it is worth discussing the different demands with experienced jobholders. Remember to focus on the needs of the job and not on the person who is undertaking the job.

Where jobs change over time, try to focus on what is required over a number of cycles or changes. Comparing two jobs, using job evaluation methods, does not need to be restrictive and inflexible. Be careful to treat both jobs the same in terms of the relevant period for consideration.

NOW MOVE ON TO THE EXERCISE OF COMPARING TWO JOBS

Using Factors to Consider as a guide, use this workbook to make a note of the nature of the demands of each job. The sample on page 3 provides some guidance as to how each of the sections should be completed. Please use separate sheets if necessary.

Further copies of this workbook can be downloaded from www.closethegap.org.uk.

Once you have looked at the main demands of each post, you must complete the exercise by analysing the overall picture. This can be done by following the steps on page 16.

JOB A

COMMUNICATION SKILLS REQUIRED

JOB B

COMMUNICATION SKILLS REQUIRED

COMPARE THE DEMANDS

IS JOB A -	PLEASE TICK ONE ONLY	SCORE
MORE DEMANDING THAN JOB B OR		+1
EQUALLY DEMANDING AS B OR		0
LESS DEMANDING THAN B?		-1

JOB A

PHYSICAL SKILLS REQUIRED

JOB B

PHYSICAL SKILLS REQUIRED

COMPARE THE DEMANDS

IS JOB A -	PLEASE TICK ONE ONLY	SCORE
MORE DEMANDING THAN JOB B OR	<input type="checkbox"/>	+1
EQUALLY DEMANDING AS B OR	<input type="checkbox"/>	0
LESS DEMANDING THAN B?	<input type="checkbox"/>	-1

JOB A

RESPONSIBILITY FOR INTERNAL RESOURCES

JOB B

RESPONSIBILITY FOR INTERNAL RESOURCES

COMPARE THE DEMANDS

IS JOB A -	PLEASE TICK ONE ONLY	SCORE
MORE DEMANDING THAN JOB B OR		+1
EQUALLY DEMANDING AS B OR		0
LESS DEMANDING THAN B?		-1

JOB A

RESPONSIBILITY FOR EXTERNAL RESOURCES

JOB B

RESPONSIBILITY FOR EXTERNAL RESOURCES

COMPARE THE DEMANDS

IS JOB A -	PLEASE TICK ONE ONLY	SCORE
MORE DEMANDING THAN JOB B OR		+1
EQUALLY DEMANDING AS B OR		0
LESS DEMANDING THAN B?		-1

JOB A

RANGE OF KNOWLEDGE REQUIRED

JOB B

RANGE OF KNOWLEDGE REQUIRED

JOB A

DEPTH OF KNOWLEDGE REQUIRED

JOB B

DEPTH OF KNOWLEDGE REQUIRED

JOB A

KNOWLEDGE DEVELOPMENT

JOB B

KNOWLEDGE DEVELOPMENT

COMPARE THE DEMANDS

IS JOB A -	PLEASE TICK ONE ONLY	SCORE
MORE DEMANDING THAN JOB B OR	<input type="checkbox"/>	+1
EQUALLY DEMANDING AS B OR	<input type="checkbox"/>	0
LESS DEMANDING THAN B?	<input type="checkbox"/>	-1

JOB A

MENTAL EFFORT REQUIRED

JOB B

MENTAL EFFORT REQUIRED

COMPARE THE DEMANDS

IS JOB A -	PLEASE TICK ONE ONLY	SCORE
MORE DEMANDING THAN JOB B OR	<input type="checkbox"/>	+1
EQUALLY DEMANDING AS B OR	<input type="checkbox"/>	0
LESS DEMANDING THAN B?	<input type="checkbox"/>	-1

JOB A

PHYSICAL EFFORT REQUIRED

JOB B

PHYSICAL EFFORT REQUIRED

COMPARE THE DEMANDS

IS JOB A -	PLEASE TICK ONE ONLY	SCORE
MORE DEMANDING THAN JOB B OR	<input type="checkbox"/>	+1
EQUALLY DEMANDING AS B OR	<input type="checkbox"/>	0
LESS DEMANDING THAN B?	<input type="checkbox"/>	-1

JOB A

RISK

JOB B

RISK

COMPARE THE DEMANDS

IS JOB A -	PLEASE TICK ONE ONLY	SCORE
MORE DEMANDING THAN JOB B OR	<input type="checkbox"/>	+1
EQUALLY DEMANDING AS B OR	<input type="checkbox"/>	0
LESS DEMANDING THAN B?	<input type="checkbox"/>	-1

JOB A

UNPLEASANT CONDITIONS

JOB B

UNPLEASANT CONDITIONS

COMPARE THE DEMANDS

IS JOB A -	PLEASE TICK ONE ONLY	SCORE
MORE DEMANDING THAN JOB B OR		+1
EQUALLY DEMANDING AS B OR		0
LESS DEMANDING THAN B?		-1



Now that you have looked at each of the main demands you now have to complete the exercise by examining the complete picture, this can be done by following the steps below:

Enter a summary of findings in the table below

	JOB A SCORE COMPARED TO JOB B
SKILLS: COMMUNICATIONS	
SKILLS: PHYSICAL	
RESPONSIBILITIES: INTERNAL RESOURCES	
RESPONSIBILITIES: EXTERNAL RESOURCES	
KNOWLEDGE: APPLICATION OF	
SUB TOTAL	
EFFORT: MENTAL	
EFFORT: PHYSICAL	
WORKING CONDITIONS: RISK	
WORKING CONDITIONS: UNPLEASANT CONDITIONS	
SUB TOTAL	



You must now decide whether it is appropriate for you to adjust the rate of pay for one of these posts. The table of scores on page 16 will help you to do this.

First, consider the scores for the first three factors. Are the scores fairly balanced across the first three factors? You are not looking for all scores to be zero, but for the demands of the two jobs to balance out.

Second, consider the scores for the last two factors. Are the scores fairly balanced across the last two factors? Again, you are not necessarily looking for all scores to be zero, but for the demands of the two jobs to balance out.

If, taken together, the first three elements appear balanced, and then, taken together, the last two elements appear balanced, then there are reasonable grounds for considering the jobs to be of equal value.

Unless you pay spot rates of pay you are not looking for two sub totals of zero.

If, however, there is a clear distinction between the jobs both in terms of the first three elements and the second set of elements, then on the balance of probability the jobs are not equal in value.

Once you have determined whether the jobs are or are not of equal value, then you may wish to consider the scale of differences between the jobs and determine whether the difference in pay is more substantial than this.

It may be that the scale of the difference in pay should be reduced in order to establish fair pay differences.

SKILLS, RESPONSIBILITIES AND APPLICATION OF KNOWLEDGE

EFFORT AND WORKING CONDITIONS



PUBLISHED OCTOBER 2005



www.closehegap.org.uk